

2013 U.S. Trail Orienteering Championships
Moreau Lake State Park, NY
May 11, 2013

I am sorry for the lateness of these results. It turns out that the result folder was place in a car that looked a lot like my car and it took a week to get them back. I apologize for the delay in posting them.

Course setter comments in more detail are shown after the results.

Name	Control	1	2	3	4	A or C	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	T1	time	penalty	total	correct
answer	B	B	NC	a	C	A	Z	B	A	A	Z	C	B	C	B	C			(sec)	(sec)	(sec)	
Natalia Deconescu	b	b	b	a	c	a	b	b	a	b	z	c	b	c	b	c			20.6		20.6	13
Brendan Shields	b	z	c	a	c	a	z	b	a	a	c	c	b	c	b	c			23.4		23.4	13
Hans Bengtsson	c	b	c	a	c	a	z	b	b	a	c	c	b	c	b	c			12.3		12.3	12
Scott Drumm	c	b	a	a	c	a	b	b	a	a	z	c	b	c	b	d			15.9	60	75.9	12
Eric Bone	b	b	c	a	c	a	z	b	a	b	b	c	b	c	b	b			53.4	60	113.4	12
Tom Svobodny	c	b	c	a	c	c	z	b	a	b	c	c	b	c	b	c			12.1		12.1	11
Michael Schuh	b	b	c	a	c	a	b	c	a	a	b	c	b	b	b	c			12.8		12.8	11
Ron Bortz	b	b	z	c	c	a	b	b	b	a	c	c	b	c	b	c			13.4		13.4	11
Karen Dennis	b	z	c	a	a	a	z	c	b	a	z	c	b	b	b	c			14.6		14.6	11
David Irving	b	b	c	a	z	a	a	b	b	a	c	c	b	c	b	c			17.1		17.1	11
Walter Siegenthaler	c	b	c	a	c	a	c	b	b	a	z	c	b	b	b	c			18.2		18.2	11
Eric Smith	b	z	b	a	c	a	b	c	b	a	z	c	b	c	b	c			19.5		19.5	11
Jim Hall	c	b	b	a	c	a	c	c	a	a	z	c	b	b	b	c			22.1		22.1	11
Mike Poulsen	c	b	b	a	c	a	z	a	a	a	c	z	b	c	b	c			49.6		49.6	11
Bob Cooley	a	b	b	a	a	a	z	b	a	b	b	c	b	c	b	e			7.5	60	67.5	11
Joe Brautigam	b	b	c	a	c	a	z	c	a	b	z	c	z	c	b	d			14.6	60	74.6	11
Robert Turbyfill	b	b	b	a	c	a	z	b	b	b	c	c	z	b	b	c			15.3		15.3	10
Piotr Zielczynski	c	c	c	a	c	a	z	b	a	b	c	b	b	c	b	c			19.2		19.2	10
Mitchel Hansen	z	b	b	b	c	a	b	b	a	b	z	c	b	c	b	e			27.7	60	87.7	10
Joseph Huberman	c	b	b	a	z	a	z	c	b	a	a	c	b	b	b	c			10.9		10.9	9
Karl Ahlswede	c	z	b	a	c	a	z	b	b	b	b	c	b	b	b	c			13		13	9
Sharon Crawford	z	b	c	a	c	a	z	c	a	b	c	c	z	b	b	c			16.8		16.8	9
Ruth Bromer	c	b	b	a	b	a	c	b	z	a	b	c	b	b	b	c			28.2		28.2	9
Nancy Allen	c	a	b	a	b	a	b	b	b	a	b	c	b	c	b	c			38.2		38.2	9
Ed Hicks	z	b	b	a	c	a	z	c	a	z	b	c	b	c	a	b			12.2	60	72.2	9
Andrea Schneider	b	b	b	a	c	a	z	b	b	b	b	z	a	c	b	d			22.9	60	82.9	9
Gavin Wyatt-Mair	b	b	c	a	a	a	z	a	a	b	c	b	b	b	b	z			35.4	60	95.4	9
Rick Shane	b	a	z	a	a	a	c	b	b	b	c	c	b	c	b	e			53.2	60	113.2	9
Richard H. Ebright	z	b	b	a	z	a	a	c	a	a	b	b	b	b	b	c			18.4		18.4	8
Lisa McNerney	z	a	c	a	z	a	z	a	a	b	c	c	b	b	b	c			20.3		20.3	8
Sergey Velichko	b	a	c	a	b	a	z	a	a	c	b	b	b	c	b	d			60	60	120	8
Rob Wilkison	c	b	b	a	b	a	c	c	a	z	b	b	b	b	b	c			22.7		22.7	7
Stephen Granger-Bevan	c	b	c	a	z	b	z	c	b	b	c	c	b	z	b	c			30.2		30.2	7
Ian Shields	c	b	b	a	b	a	a	c	a	b	a	c	b	b	a	c			30.7		30.7	7
Lori Huberman	c	b	b	a	z	b	c	c	a	a	z	c	z	c	a	d			5.8	60	65.8	7
Clare Durand	c	c	z	a	a	a	z	c	b	b	z	b	b	c	a	e			6.6	60	66.6	7
Guy Olsen	b	b	c	a	a	a	b	a	z	b	c	c	z	a	b	d			11.6	60	71.6	7
Dean Sturtevant	c	a	c	a	z	a	z	a	a	b	c	c	b	a	b	e			14.6	60	74.6	7
Thomas Laraia	c	a	z	a	c	a	c	b	b	a	b	b	b	z	b	b			25.9	60	85.9	7
Sandy Ahlswede	b	b	b	b	c	a	z	a	b	b	b	b	b	d	b	e			27.4	60	87.4	7
Richard Y. Ebright	b	c	c	a	c	z	z	b	a	b	c	b	z	b	b	b			43.9	60	103.9	7
Jane Pataki	b	a	b	b	a	a	b	c	b	a	c	c	b	c	a	d			54.1	60	114.1	7
Sandy Fillebrown	z	a	b	a	c	a	z	c	b	z	b	b	z	c	a	d			18.5	60	78.5	5
Louis Pataki	c	z	c	b	c	a	c	b	b	b	c	b	b	c	z	a			19.7	60	79.7	5
Phillip Friddle	c	z	b	b	e	c	z	c	c	a	a	b	a	c	a	c			14.6		14.6	4
Peter Friddle	c	b	c	z	b	a	c	a	b	b	c	b	b	b	a	e			16.9	60	76.9	3
Recreational																						
answer	B	B	NC	B	C	A	Z	B	A	A	B	B	B	D	B							
Sagi Levy	b	b	b	a	c	a	c	b	a	a	c	b	b	d	b							11
Federer Group	b	b	c	b	c	a	c	c	b	a	b	a	b	d	b							10
Jim Blanchard	b	b	b	a	z	a	c	b	a	b	z	b	b	d	b							9
Ilona Dobos	b	a	c	z	c	c	z	a	a	z	c	a	b	d	b							7
Daria Babushok	c	a	b	a	c	a	z	c	a	z	c	a	b	d	b							7
Bob and Beth Lux	c	b	b	a	c	a	c	z	b	z	b	a	z	d	b							6
Rui Tavares	c	b	c	a	b	a	b	c	b	b	c	b	b	z	b							5

Course Setter's Comments:

Control #3 was not counted because of the IOF control description was not allowed for a "point" object, although this beaver house was anything but a "point" object.

Control #5 allowed both A and C as answers based on the interpretation of IOF definitions, though A was not an issue for the top 10 places.

Timed Control #2 was not used because, while it was a correctly placed control, the time factor made it so that virtually all of the competitors got it wrong. It was a distance estimation problem and the perspective made it hard to arrive at the correct answer. The control circle was 1/3 of the way from the trail to the point of land. E was at that position. D was about 2/3rds of the way to the point of land but because of the perspective, the long distance to view the controls (and perhaps people not even being able to see them at the great distance), this control was not used.

One of the issues with the course was the red "x"s on the map. I apologize for having them there. They were not supposed to be on the map. The amendments to the meet notes said that they were "only approximate in their position" so they were not points of reference. However, they did take up space on the map although all competitors had the same problem.

Control circles were not the "approved size" either but the difference was less than 20% and then there is the question as to whether the size talks about the inner or outer radius. They can also be made 30% smaller if "need be". The dot knolls were also slightly off standard size. A few were made larger because they were larger knolls. This is accepted IOF practice because dot knolls can be elongated. These "larger" knolls were round instead of oblong because they were round in the terrain.

Much of the mapping information was done with a laser rangefinder showing distances plus or minus about a meter. This is important because it is related to a number of the comments about particular controls.

The solution sheets handed out after the last starts give some of the solution methods for arriving at the correct answers, but what follows is more information on the control placement:

1. A-C Saddle

The saddle was quite subtle but there was a saddle there. Contours were drawn so that they matched the height of land to the south side of the trail. The distance from the trail to the west of the control was correct; the map showed a saddle and while the saddle was only a few inches lower than the rest, the map showed it.

2. A-C Reentrant

Walking along the trail, there was a rather clear change in direction. The trail was straight to the south and north of this bend for at least 50 meters or so in each direction. The change in direction was more than 10 degrees and was shown on the map. The position of the trail bend was documented by laser rangefinder from each of the flags. A and C were not "in the center line of the reentrant." A was on the hillside and C was too far from the center line.

3. A-C Anthill (beaver lodge), eastern part.

A beaver house is not in the IOF control symbol list. This beaver house was about 20 meters by 10 meters and was not a point feature although the perceived symbol, for an anthill, was indicated in the meet notes as a beaver house rather than an anthill. While there may have been ants or termites somewhere in the house, this was not an anthill or termite mound as indicated in the meet notes. Mapping it as a form line object may have been a better approach. However, this control, because of the "point feature" problem, will not be counted in the results.

4. A-C Small knoll, northwestern foot

According to IOF standards, the dot knoll should not have touched the contour line. However, the position of the dot knoll was placed on the map in accordance with distances from the trail and trail bends and junctions. If the dot knoll was clearly visible, then it should not be a problem for competitors.

5. A-E Between the knolls

For this control, one dot knoll was drawn larger than others on the map because it took up more space in the terrain. Dot knolls can be drawn in an elongated fashion as well. The knoll to the northeast was much larger than the others so it was drawn this way. Because there were no ditches anywhere on the map and none could be imagined in the area around the

dot knolls seen at relatively close range, it would be hard to construe these brown dots as ditches. The actual size of the brown dots was chosen for clarity in other places and all dot knolls should be the same size.

6. A-C Reentrant

The circle is centered on the reentrant between the two knolls. The competitor must identify the spur, the two knolls, and the reentrant, and determine which flag, if any, is at the center of the circle. In this case, the size of the dot knolls allowed the contour lines to be seen and the reason for the size of the dots.

7. A-C Reentrant

For this control, the mapping of the reentrant with the flags may have been a bit overdone and the contour line moved up or down the hillside slightly but the contour line near the top of the reentrant was made to outline all the small reentrants to the left and right in the area.

8. A-C Spur

In this case, the distance from each of the controls to mapped bends in the trails is accurate to plus or minus two or three meters but is probably more exact based on laser rangefinder and direct transfer of the map notes to OCAD. From each of the trail bends where the controls could be seen, the direction to the circled flag was correct. If you were using distance estimation from the closest point to the trail from the controls, that distance, also is within a meter or two of the actual distance. Using a contour line in this area is not particularly a good method because the spur is broad and where it crosses the trail is a long way from the control so it would be hard to figure the correct position up or down from the flag. The position is most definitely on the spur but using the contour line is subject to error even though a number of people used this method, ignoring other more definitive positioning methods. Distance estimation and direction from trail bends and distance from the trail all give the correct answer. That makes four correct methods to one method that may give the wrong answer based on perceived positions of contour lines. If the lines were drawn on the ground, it would have been easy to see where it was, but they are only drawn on the map. You may not have known how accurately the trails were mapped but it might have been worth investigating.....

9. A-C Reentrant

While the contour method for figuring out this control may be good, looking at any contour from below is never easy. A better way to find this position is to use the trail junction. Your view of contour lines, especially from below, is not always correct. Again, the distances to the flags from the trail were measured with laser so they were correct. Because this reentrant extends beyond sight, putting it as the lower or upper part is a distraction.

10. A-B Spur

I apologize for the red "X" as they should not be on the map. I was not clear on the rules. I clearly made a mistake but everyone had the same issue. The jury also looked at this issue and indicated that there were other ways to identify the correct position. This spur continues down slope for quite a way below even the B flag. Saying that it is on the lower part is incorrect. The position of the correct flag can be found from either the bend in the trail or by distance estimation by two methods. The first is the distance of the flag from the trail where B is not correct and A is. The other method is to use the bend in the trail and the trail junction to the north. Pace count and find the midpoint, realizing that some of your walking is up hill so this is not as easy as it might seem. Once at the mid-point, it is clear that B is not correct and that A is correct.

11. A-C Depression, northern part

There was a question as to whether this control was correctly described. The IOF does not resolve the issue completely and if there is a difference between the NW part and the N part in the control descriptions, then there is a distinction between "which" part. The line of controls from the center of the depression was clearly going to the Northwest so none of the controls were in the correct place. Comments about where the contour lines are actually placed are valid points, but the position of the flags says that none are correct. This control was protested but the protest was denied by the jury.

12. A-C Hill

A number of ways showed the size/length of this small hill. The circle is centered on a hill, and the description is simply "hill", so the flag location, by default, should be at the center of the mapped hill contour (which, by the way, does not necessarily have to be the highest point on the hill.)

The competitor must determine the size and extent of the hill in the terrain, and whether there is a flag at the center of the circle/hill.

13. A-B Spur

The center of the circle on the map, on a broad spur, is located 7 mm from the trail, i.e., 28 m (92 ft) in the terrain. In this particular case, apparent distance estimation technique was confounded by the fact that the viewer is looking up hill. The three members of the jury started from three positions, the closest point on the trail to the control, the trail junction and the reentrant near the viewing station. Using pace count, all three arrived at within a few feet of the control. The B flag was at the approximate 28 meter distance from the trail.

14. A-D Vegetation boundary, northern edge

As you walked on the trail to the west of the flags to get to the viewing location, the B flag was in the middle of rather dense trees. The visibility was impeded in this area and it was most definitely light green from the foot-O perspective. The sight lines for the light green were rather nebulous and it was difficult to use these to see if either B or C were the correct control from places near the viewing station. It was a bit difficult to determine the northern extent of the "openness" of the area to control C but because there were no bushes or trees or branches in the way, that area would be considered runnable. Control B was obscured by various tree branches so it was not in the open.

15. A-C Root stock, northwestern side

The flags were at the edge of the uprooted ground of the rootstock so as to make them separate from one another. They were not touching the woody part, itself but were in "contact" with the rootstock.

T1 Timed control on spur.

The circle was on the spur in the sand, not at the edge of the water and not at the forest. B and D controls were placed so that they were above a "straight" section of the shore so they were not on the spur.

I thank all the people who helped with this event and the support that they gave.

Please let me know if you find errors in the answers that you gave. I believe that they have been verified against the control cards quite carefully.

Peter Goodwin
Course Setter